

1 EDMUND G. BROWN JR.
Attorney General of California
2 FRANCES T. GRUNDER
Senior Assistant Attorney General
3 KATHRIN SEARS
Supervising Deputy Attorney General
4 PAUL STEIN (SBN184956)
ALEXANDRA ROBERT GORDON (SBN207650)
5 Deputy Attorneys General
455 Golden Gate Avenue, Suite 11000
6 San Francisco, CA 94102-7004
Telephone: (415) 703-5740
7 Fax: (415) 703-5480
E-mail: Paul.Stein@doj.ca.gov

8 FRANK LINDH (SBN157986)
General Counsel
9 HELEN MICKIEWICZ (SBN123184)
Assistant General Counsel
10 GERALDINE KIM (SBN 243636)
Public Utilities Counsel
11 California Public Utilities Commission
12 505 Van Ness Avenue
San Francisco, CA 94102
13 Telephone: (415) 355-5524
Fax: (415) 703-4465

14 *Attorneys for Plaintiff,*
15 *the People of the State of California*

17 SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
18 FOR THE COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

20 **PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF**
21 **CALIFORNIA,**
22
23 **v.**
24 **TOTAL CALL INTERNATIONAL, INC.,**
25
26 **Defendant.**

Plaintiff,

CASE NO.
~~PROPOSED~~ FINAL JUDGMENT AND
PERMANENT INJUNCTION

Date:
Time:
Dept:
Judge
Trial Date

**ENDORSED
FILED**
San Francisco County Superior Court
MAY 08 2009
GORDON PARK-LI, Clerk
BY: ERICKA LARNAUTI
Deputy Clerk

1 Plaintiff the People of the State of California, appearing through its attorneys, Edmund G.
2 Brown Jr., Attorney General, by Deputy Attorneys General Paul Stein and Alexandra Robert
3 Gordon, and the California Public Utilities Commission, by Public Utilities Counsel Geraldine
4 Kim; and Defendant Total Call International, Inc., appearing through its attorneys, Kelley Drye &
5 Warren LLP, by Donna Wilson, having come before this Court, and it appearing to the Court that
6 the parties, as reflected in the Stipulation for Entry of Final Judgment and Permanent Injunction
7 (hereafter “Stipulation”) filed herewith, having stipulated and consented to the entry of this Final
8 Judgment and Permanent Injunction (hereafter “Judgment”) without the taking of proof and
9 without trial or adjudication of any fact or issue of law (i.e., this Judgment shall not constitute
10 evidence or an admission by Total Call International, Inc., regarding any issue of law or fact
11 alleged in the Complaint), the Court having considered the matter and good cause appearing,

12 Therefore, the Court ORDERS, ADJUDGES, AND DECREES:

13 1. This Court has jurisdiction of the subject matter of this action and of the parties.
14 Venue as to all matters between the parties relating to this action is proper in this Court.

15 DEFINITIONS

16 2. The following definitions shall apply to this Judgment:

17 A. “Prepaid Calling Service(s)” or “Service(s)” shall be defined as those terms are
18 defined in Business and Professions Code section 17538.9.

19 B. “Prepaid Calling Card(s)” or “Card(s)” shall be defined as those terms are defined in
20 Business and Professions Code section 17538.9 and as the term “telephone prepaid debit card” is
21 used in California Public Utilities Code section 885.

22 C. “Legible” or “Legibly” means easily readable.

23 D. “Ancillary Charges” means all surcharges, taxes, fees, connection charges,
24 maintenance fees, monthly or other periodic fees, per-call access fees, or other assessments or
25 charges of any kind, however denominated, that may be imposed during the life of the purchased
26 Prepaid Calling Services, in connection with the use of a Card or Services, other than the per unit
27 or per minute rate charged.

28

1 E. "Clearly and Conspicuously" means, for writings, disclosed Legibly and placed and
2 printed so that it will attract the reader's attention and, for oral statements, orally disclosed so that
3 it will attract the listener's attention. To be clear and conspicuous, disclosures must also be stated
4 precisely, clearly, and understandably, in words that are part of the working vocabulary of the
5 average consumer. Other content, such as text, graphics, or sound, that may distract a consumer's
6 attention away from any disclosure required to be clear and conspicuous may not be used. If a
7 disclosure qualifies other information, to be clear and conspicuous the disclosure must be
8 displayed prominently and in close proximity to the representation being qualified.

9 F. "Effective Rate" means the total amount of (1) the per-unit (e.g. per-minute) charge
10 applicable for Prepaid Calling Services and (2) the Ancillary Charges that will be incurred, if the
11 value of the PIN (Personal Identifying Number) is exhausted in one continuous call, stated either
12 as an amount for each unit (e.g. "\$0.10 per minute") or in minutes of talk time available on a PIN
13 to a stated or dialed destination. The Effective Rate need not account for Ancillary Charges that
14 may or may not be incurred depending on a customer's usage pattern and which the Enjoined
15 Parties cannot anticipate at the time the disclosure is made (e.g., a charge for calling from a
16 payphone or to a cellphone would not have to be incorporated into the Effective Rate stated in an
17 advertisement because a customer may or may not use a payphone or call a cell phone).

18 G. "Prompt" is the automated statement of the Effective Rate, which is made after the
19 customer enters a PIN and a destination number.

20 H. "United States" means the United States of America, including all fifty states and any
21 of its territories and possessions.

22 I. "CPUC" means the California Public Utilities Commission.

23 J. "Statement" means "statement" as that term is used in Business and Professions Code
24 section 17500 (including any advertising or poster).

25 INJUNCTION

26 3. The injunctive provisions of this Judgment apply to (a) the Defendant; (b) any of
27 Defendant's affiliates, subsidiaries, directors, officers, employees, agents, assigns, successors, and
28 all persons acting in concert or participation with any of them that have actual or constructive

1 knowledge of the Judgment; (c) any company or other entity offering Prepaid Calling Services in
2 which any of Defendant's directors, affiliates, subsidiaries, assigns, or successors own or control
3 at least 10% of the equity or debt; and (d) any company or other entity offering Prepaid Calling
4 Services in which any person who is a director of Defendant's board as of the date of the
5 execution of the Stipulation comes to own or control at least 10% of the equity or debt. The
6 individuals and entities referenced in this paragraph 3 are collectively the "Enjoined Parties."

7 4. Pursuant to Business and Professions Code sections 17203 and 17535 and Public
8 Utilities Code section 2102, the Enjoined Parties are hereby permanently enjoined and restrained
9 from directly or indirectly doing any of the following in connection with Prepaid Calling Services
10 advertised, offered for sale, or sold in California:

11 A. Violating Business and Professions Code sections 17200, 17500, or 17538.9.

12 B. Failing to provide a Prompt immediately after a caller enters a personal identification
13 number and destination number, which Clearly and Conspicuously discloses the Effective Rate
14 applicable to that call, and, unless the same effective rate applies to all calls, a Statement to the
15 effect the rate applies only if the Prepaid Calling Service/Card/PIN is used up in one continuous
16 call (e.g. "You have 75 minutes if used up in this call").

17 C. In any print or oral Statement, other than in a Prompt, which purports to state either
18 the minutes of talk time available or a per-unit cost,

19 (1) failing to use only the "Effective Rate" when stating the minutes of talk time or the
20 per-unit cost;

21 (2) unless the same Effective Rate applies to all calls, failing to Clearly and
22 Conspicuously disclose that the minutes of talk time or per-unit cost stated (i.e., the Effective
23 Rate) is available only if the Prepaid Calling Service/Card/PIN is used up in one continuous call,
24 provided however, that for Statements referring to three or more calling destinations, if the
25 required disclosure is prominently displayed at or near the top (or the beginning) of the Statement
26 so that it clearly refers to all the destinations, the required disclosure may be made once and need
27 not be placed proximate to each calling destination; and
28

1 (3) if two or more Effective Rates apply to a specified destination depending on either the
2 day of the week or the time of day of a call, failing to disclose either (a) Clearly and
3 Conspicuously each Effective Rate for the specified destination along with the day and or time to
4 which it applies in immediate proximity to the specified destination, or (b) only the highest
5 possible Effective Rate to the specified destination.

6 D. Failing to prominently disclose, Clearly and Conspicuously, near the beginning of
7 any Statement subject to Paragraph 4.C. above, and on either the Card or its packaging, all
8 Ancillary Charges applicable to the Card or Service, along with the conditions under which such
9 Ancillary Charges will be imposed (e.g., a \$.05 fee that is imposed after the first week the Card is
10 used and repeats at a stated interval thereafter). In a written Statement subject to Paragraph 4.C.
11 above, this disclosure shall appear in table form in a box with the bold label: "Other Charges."
12 The amount of each Ancillary Charge shall be identified in one column and the conditions under
13 which each applies shall be stated on the same line in the column to the right of the charge.

14 E. At any time before a customer has recharged a Card or Service (including before a
15 Card or Service expires without recharge), (1) providing fewer minutes of talk time or charging
16 more than any Effective Rate contained in a Statement available to the public at the time the Card
17 or Service was purchased or than specified in any Prompt, or (2) charging more for Ancillary
18 Charges than any charge contained in any Statement available to the public at the time the Card or
19 Service was purchased.

20 F. If the Effective Rate disclosure provisions of Paragraph 4.C. do not apply because
21 Defendant's Statements, including Statements on either the Card or packaging of a Prepaid
22 Calling Card or Service, do not include a claim about the minutes of talk time available to any
23 given calling destination or a per-unit cost offered to any given calling destination, failing to
24 disclose on the Card or packaging, the amount of each and every Ancillary Charge on calls to
25 destinations within the United States, and the conditions under which such Ancillary Charges will
26 be imposed (e.g., a \$.05 fee that is imposed after the first week the Card is used and repeats at a
27 stated interval thereafter).

28

1 G. If the Effective Rate disclosure provisions of Paragraph 4.C. do not apply because
2 Defendant's Statements, including on either the Card or packaging of a Prepaid Calling Card or
3 Service, do not include a claim about the minutes of talk time available or a per-unit cost, failing
4 to disclose on the Card or packaging, either (1) the amount of each and every Ancillary Charge on
5 calls to destinations outside the United States and the conditions under which such Ancillary
6 Charges will be imposed (e.g., a \$.05 fee that is imposed after the first week the Card is used and
7 repeats at a stated interval thereafter) or, in the alternative, (2) the highest amounts of Ancillary
8 Charges that may be incurred on calls to destinations outside the United States, and the conditions
9 under which such Ancillary Charges will be imposed.

10 H. Failing to ensure that the disclosures required by Paragraphs 4.C., 4.D., 4.F., and 4.G.
11 which are printed on a Prepaid Calling Card or its packaging are Legible without having to open
12 any packaging.

13 I. Failing to comply with the customer service requirements set forth in Business and
14 Professions Code section 17538.9, subdivision (b)(9). In the event that the requirements of
15 section 17538.9, subdivision (b)(9), are amended or repealed, in whole or in part, the Enjoined
16 Parties shall comply with section 17538.9, subdivision (b)(9), as modified.

17 J. For at least four years from entry of Judgment, failing to maintain all of the business
18 records useful, necessary, and sufficient to determine Defendant's compliance with Paragraph 4
19 of this Judgment and Paragraphs L and M of the Stipulation, including but not limited to the
20 records listed in Exhibit 1 hereto.

21 K. For two years from entry of Judgment, failing to provide to Plaintiff, within 10 days
22 of the request, any documents required to be maintained under this Judgment, and thereafter,
23 failing to provide Plaintiff with requested documents in accordance with the requirements of the
24 law.

25 CIVIL PENALTIES AND COSTS

26 5. Pursuant to Business and Professions Code sections 17206 and 17536 and Public
27 Utilities Code section 2107, and as specified in the Stipulation, the Defendant shall pay civil
28 penalties and investigative costs totaling \$450,000 and broken down as follows:

1 9. Defendant will provide a copy of this Judgment to all Enjoined Parties and retain for
2 inspection proof of having done so.

3 RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

4 10. This Court shall retain jurisdiction over this matter for the purposes of enabling
5 any party to this Judgment to apply to the Court at any time, after serving notice on the other
6 parties, for such further orders and directions as might be necessary or appropriate for the
7 construction or carrying out of this Judgment, for modification or termination of any injunctive
8 provision of this Judgment, and for the People to apply at any time for enforcement of any
9 provisions of this Judgment and for punishment for any violation of this Judgment.

10 11. This Judgment shall take effect immediately upon its entry.

11 12. The clerk is ordered to enter this Judgment forthwith.

12
13 IT IS SO ORDERED:

14
15 DATE: 5-8-09

CHARLOTTE WALTER WOOLARD
16 JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT

17
18
19
20 SF2004IN0008
40323428.doc

EXHIBIT 1

A. All business records relating to the sales or other transfers of Prepaid Calling Cards to California-based wholesalers, distributors, retailers, California end-use consumers, or other California purchasers. As used herein, "California-based" refers to wholesalers, distributors, or retailers who sell to California consumers, or to others in any distribution chain where the phonecard product is likely to be sold in California.

B. Samples of every non-identical promotional, sales, and other advertising material, as well as samples of every prepaid calling card sold by Defendant and every type of packaging relating to such cards, which materials and/or cards were sold or used in California, or may have been sold or used in California.

D. Rate decks, including complete records of every change made to such rate decks (as used herein, "rate deck" means the schedule of all rates, ancillary charges, taxes, and any other fee however designated, applied to every prepaid calling card which was sold or may have been sold in California).

E. Other records useful, necessary and sufficient to identify the Effective Rate and Ancillary Charges for calls placed using any of the prepaid calling cards which Defendants sell, cause to be sold, or allow to be sold in California, or are otherwise likely to be sold in California.

F. All call detail records generated by each activated prepaid calling card, where the first call was made in California.

G. All invoices from carriers to Defendant, record of payment to those carriers, and Defendant's generated reconciliations of carrier invoices to Defendant's rates used in its cost data warehouse.

H. All historical records in the cost data warehouse, or any other such system used by Defendant in calculating its incurred carrier costs for providing services on California-based prepaid calling cards.